



THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA

600 SOUTHEAST THIRD AVENUE • FORT LAUDERDALE, FLORIDA 33301-3125 • TEL 754-321-2050 • FAX 754-321-2705

OFFICE OF THE GENERAL COUNSEL
J. PAUL CARLAND, II, GENERAL COUNSEL
www.browardschools.com

SCHOOL BOARD
DONNA P. KORN, *Chair*
DR. ROSALIND OSGOOD, *Vice Chair*

ROBIN BARTLEMAN
HEATHER P. BRINKWORTH
ABBY M. FREEDMAN
PATRICIA GOOD
LAURIE RICH LEVINSON
ANN MURRAY
NORA RUPERT

ROBERT W. RUNCIE
Superintendent of Schools

August 12, 2015

Mary Li Creasy, Administrative Law Judge
Division of Administrative Hearings
The DeSoto Building
1230 Apalachee Parkway
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1550

RE: TOSHIBA BUSINESS SOLUTIONS (USA), INC. V. THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA, DOAH CASE NO.: 14-5300BID

Dear Judge Creasy:

For the Division's file, enclosed please find the Final Order concerning the above-referenced matter.

Very truly yours,



J. Paul Carland, II

JPC:jcf
Enclosure

C: Robert Paul Vignola, Deputy General Counsel (Via Eserve)
William G. Salim, Jr., Esq. (Via Eserve)
Eric J. Rayman, Esq. (Via Eserve)
Albert E. Dotson, Jr., Esq. (Via Eserve) / Wendy Francois, Esq.
Robert W. Runcie, Superintendent of Schools
Ruby Crenshaw, Director - Procurement & Warehousing Services

fritz/allwork/agenda/2015/08-04-15-1-toshiba- final order judge

Educating Today's Students for Tomorrow's World
Broward County Public Schools Is An Equal Opportunity/Equal Access Employer

Filed August 12, 2015 11:30 AM Division of Administrative Hearings

THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA

TOSHIBA BUSINESS SOLUTIONS (USA),
INC.,

Petitioner,

vs.

THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD
COUNTY, FLORIDA,

Respondent,

and

IMAGENET CONSULTING OF MIAMI,
INC.,

Intervenor.

DOAH CASE NO. 14-5300 BID

ITB No. 15-048E “Multifunctional
Devices, Cost-Per-Copy”

SSBM Agenda: 08-04-15-1

FINAL ORDER

THIS CAUSE came before THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA on August 4, 2015 to (1) consider the Recommended Order entered on June 15, 2015 by Mary Li Creasy, Administrative Law Judge (hereinafter “ALJ”) of the State of Florida Division of Administrative Hearings; (2) Petitioner’s Exceptions to the Recommended Order; (3) Respondent’s and Intervenor’s Responses in Opposition to Exceptions; and (4) Respondent’s Cost Affidavit.

THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA, having reviewed the record and having heard oral arguments presented by representatives on behalf of the parties, and being fully advised in the Premises:

IT IS THEREUPON ADJUDGED that:

1. THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA rejects Exceptions A, B and C filed by the Petitioner, TOSHIBA BUSINESS SOLUTIONS (USA), INC.

2. THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA accepts, approves and adopts in its entirety the Recommended Order attached hereto as Exhibit "A" and incorporated herein by reference; dismisses the bid protest of the Petitioner, TOSHIBA BUSINESS SOLUTIONS (USA), INC.; and upholds the agency's intended award of contracts under ITB 15-048E to the Intervenor, IMAGENET CONSULTING OF FLORIDA, INC., as the primary awardee for Item 1 and to INNOVATIVE SOFTWARE SOLUTION, INC. as the alternate awardee for Item 1, and to RICOH USA, INC. as the primary awardee for Item 3 and to the Intervenor, IMAGENET CONSULTING OF FLORIDA, INC., as the alternate awardee for Item 3.

3. Costs in the amount of \$12,390.68 are hereby awarded in favor of the Respondent, THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA, and against the Petitioner, TOSHIBA BUSINESS SOLUTIONS (USA), INC.

DONE AND ORDERED in Fort Lauderdale, Broward County, Florida this 11th day of August, 2015.

THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD
COUNTY, FLORIDA

By 
DONNA P. KORN, CHAIR

Filed in Official School Board Records the
11 day of August, 2015.


Supervisor, Official School Board Records

Copies Furnished:

ROBERT W. RUNCIE, Superintendent of
Schools
Office of the Superintendent
The School Board of Broward County, Florida
600 Southeast Third Avenue – 10th Floor
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301

WILLIAM G. SALIM, JR., ESQUIRE
Moskowitz, Mandell, Salim and
Simowitz, P.A.
Attorneys for Petitioner Toshiba
800 Corporate Drive, Suite 500
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33334

ERIC J. RAYMAN, ESQUIRE
Genovese, Joblove and Battista, P.A.
PNC Center, Suite 1110
200 East Broward Boulevard
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301

ROBERT PAUL VIGNOLA, DEPUTY
GENERAL COUNSEL
The School Board of Broward County, Florida
600 Southeast Third Avenue – 111th Floor
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301

ALBERT E. DOTSON, ESQUIRE
WENDY FRANCOIS, ESQUIRE
Bilzin, Sumberg, Baena, Price
And Axelrod, LLP
Attorneys for Intervenor ImageNet
1450 Brickell Avenue, Suite 2300
Miami, Florida 33131

STATE OF FLORIDA, DIVISION OF
ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS
The DeSoto Building
1230 Apalachee Parkway
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-3060

APPEAL OF FINAL ORDER

Pursuant to Section 120.68, Fla. Stat., a party to this proceeding may seek judicial review of this Final Order in the appropriate district court of appeal by filing a notice of appeal with Noemi Gutierrez, Agency Clerk, Official School Board Records, The School Board of Broward County, Florida, 600 Southeast Third Avenue – 2nd Floor, Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301, on or before thirty (30) days from the date of this Final Order. A copy of the notice and a copy of this Final Order, together with the appropriate filing fee, must also be filed with the Clerk, Fourth District Court of Appeal, 1525 Palm Beach Lakes Boulevard, West Palm Beach, Florida 33401-2399. If you fail to file your notice of appeal within the time prescribed by laws and the rules of court, you will lose your right to appeal this Final Order.

fritz/allwork/agenda/2015/080415 toshiba/ final order/draft 2